

Minutes from Public Meeting
Held June 2, 2017, at Port of San Francisco Offices, Pier 1
Regarding Retail Fish Sales off Boats at Fisherman's Wharf



Meeting Minutes

The purpose of this meeting was to discuss a possible program to allow retail fish sales from boats Fisherman's Wharf Harbor at the Port of San Francisco.

Participants at this meeting included fishing boat operators, fish processors, fishing harbors, State of California regulators, and City & County of San Francisco regulators, Port of San Francisco staff, and other interested parties.

Attendees (those who signed in):

	<u>First</u>	<u>Last</u>	<u>Company Name or Vessel Name</u>
1	Shannon	Alford	Port of San Francisco
2	Edgar	Alvarado	Port of San Francisco
3	Jim	Andersen	FV Allane (FV = Fishing Vessel)
4	Sarah	Bates	FV Bounty
5	Jeanette	Caito	Caito Fisheries Inc.
6	Chris	Calvo	FV Ruth B
7	Ryan	Carter	FV Shannon Marie
8	Brandon	Chapman	Port of San Francisco
9	Rod	Christopher	California Dept of Food & Agriculture
10	Angela	Cincotta	Alioto-Lazio Fish Company
11	Larry	Collins	Crab Boat Owner Association
12	Sean	Cross	FV Smeagol and FV Sharon Marie
13	Alex	Dmitriew	SF Dept of Environment
14	John	Draper	Pillar Point Harbor
15	Tara	Duggan	SF Chronicle
16	Sherry	Flumerfelt	Monterey Bay Fisheries Trust
17	Mike	Fontizs	FV Valley Clipper
18	Christopher	Fox	FV Victoria
19	Morgan	Gallardo	California Dept of Food & Agriculture
20	Aaron	Golbus	Port of San Francisco
21	Robert	Hannon	FV Dos Perros
22	Carmen	Kern	SF Dept of Public Health
23	Austin	Klein	Fresh Catch
24	Tom	Lee	SP Plus

Minutes from Public Meeting
Held June 2, 2017, at Port of San Francisco Offices, Pier 1
Regarding Retail Fish Sales off Boats at Fisherman's Wharf

25	Brandon	Little	FV Kathy II and FV Hason
26	Denise	Lum	Port of San Francisco
27	Michael	Macor	SF Chronicle
28	Rip	Malloy	Port of San Francisco
29	Mike	Mitchell	FV Linda Noelle
30	Cree	Morgan	SF Dept of Public Health
31	Michael	Nerney	Port of San Francisco
32	James	Ober	California Dept of Fish & Wildlife
33	Giuseppe	Pennisi	FV Pioneer
34	Joe	Reilly	Port of San Francisco
35	Jay	Schmund	Scoma's Restaurant
36	Andy	Stock	Fisherman
37	Dan	Strazzullo	All Shores Seafood
38	Noah	Wagner	Spud Point Marina
39	Jeremy	Wallenberg	Fisherman's Wharf Restaurant Assn
40	Anita	Yao	Port of San Francisco

Background

In May 1998, fishermen at Fisherman's Wharf in San Francisco approached the Port and proposed retail fish sales from boats, as allowed in other California harbors. In July 1998, a draft policy was adopted and fish sales were allowed from boats for a trial period of three months. In July 1999, the policy was updated and approved by the Port Commission to allow fish sales through October 2000. The policy expired in October 2000 and was not renewed. In January 2017, history repeated itself when fishermen again approached the Port seeking to revive the retail fish sales policy. Since February, the Port has been investigating this process through meetings and discussions with regulators, other ports, and interested parties. Today, the interested parties are here to present their views on this topic and to help the Port in addressing this issue. The Port's goal is to support the fishing industry.

Handouts included:

- Draft Policy for Retail Fish Sales from Commercial Fishing Vessels in Fisherman's Wharf Harbor (mirrors 1999 policy): <http://sfport.com/file/22241>
- Map of Fisherman's Wharf Harbor: <http://sfport.com/file/22246>
- Comments from Environmental Defense Fund: <http://sfport.com/file/22226>
- Comments from West Coast Seafood Processors Association: <http://sfport.com/file/22236>

**Minutes from Public Meeting
Held June 2, 2017, at Port of San Francisco Offices, Pier 1
Regarding Retail Fish Sales off Boats at Fisherman's Wharf**

Speakers:

Giuseppe Pennisi (Fisherman, FV Pioneer)

Giuseppe contacted the Port about selling fish off his boat at a berth next to Scoma's Restaurant on Pier 47. He believes the public should have the ability to buy fresh whole fish off the boats, especially in San Francisco, and not just frozen fish from Safeway. In his opinion, being able to sell fish off the boats would open a huge door for young people to start bringing the fishery back to life.

Brandon Little (Fisherman, FV Kathy II and FV Hason)

Brandon takes his catch out of the area and sells directly to consumers all over California at farmers markets. He understands the mark up to tourists, but strongly believes fishermen should be able to sell to the locals of San Francisco. The locals want to enjoy fresh seafood in their hometown, meet the fishermen, and be able to buy fresh seafood at a reasonable price to take home to cook. Every other port in California allows this to happen. He stated that the Department of Fish and Wildlife created a license to allow fishermen to sell their catch directly to the consumer.

Michael Mitchell (Fisherman, FV Linda Noelle)

Michael said this issue is not aimed at the wholesalers. He believes fishermen should have the option to sell fish off the boats, but stressed that the wholesalers are needed otherwise, he would be out of a job.

Jeanette Caito (Fish processor, Caito Fisheries)

Jeanette spoke of the many certificates and permits needed to do business in this industry that must be renewed each year. Fish processors also need to meet state environmental codes under the FDA (Food and Drug Administration) to protect the safety of consumption. Millions of dollars have been invested in their facilities, along with expenses for ongoing capital improvements. She stated "we know how to handle fish" and would hate to see any tainted fish on the market, as that would be bad for the industry and the Port of San Francisco. She suggested if there was any money allocated for this issue, to invest it on improving Hyde Street Harbor. She hopes there will be more discussions in regards to this issue before it takes place.

Dan Strazzullo (Fish processor, All Shores Seafood)

Dan started his fish business in 1975, selling only local fish in his retail store in San Bruno. Because he was no longer allowed to sell fish on the street, Dan invested \$250,000 and currently has a fish-processing warehouse at Pier 45. He feels everyone has the right to sell fish, but he wants everyone on the same playing field in regards to getting all the required permits from the local and state agencies.

Larry Collins (Fisherman, FV Autumn Gale, and Fish processor, SF Community Fishing Association)

Larry Collins has been the President of the Crab Boat Owner Association for the last 30 years. As a fisherman himself, he is in favor of retail sales, fishermen selling fish off the boat to the end user. As a fish processor, he does not want to see fishermen doing wholesale off the boats. As a wholesaler, Larry

**Minutes from Public Meeting
Held June 2, 2017, at Port of San Francisco Offices, Pier 1
Regarding Retail Fish Sales off Boats at Fisherman's Wharf**

is required to pay for required licenses and permits, and also invests money in keeping the Port's ice machine up and running.

John Draper (Fishing harbor, Pillar Point/Half Moon Bay)

Fish sales off the boat have been allowed at Pillar Point for 15 years. Fishermen can only sell to the consumers and not outside fish buyers. The fishermen must sign a permit and pay a fee of \$250. Some of the rules include: 1) sales can only take place in the berth; 2) sales can occur from 8am to 7pm; 3) only whole fish can be sold. Fish buyers are also allowed to sell to the public to level the playing field. John mentioned up to 2,000 people come to buy fresh fish on busy weekend.

Noah Wagner (Fishing harbor, Spud Point/Bodega Bay)

Fish and crab sales are allowed in Spud Point/Bodega Bay. He sees it as a clear benefit to the fishermen, the marina, and the consumers. Noah feels that it would make perfect sense to have fish sales off the boats in San Francisco Fisherman's Wharf. It's a declining industry and we need to help the fishermen as much as we can.

James Ober (State regulator, CA Fish & Wildlife)

James spoke of the state's regulations for fishermen to sell off the boat directly to the consumer. They must possess a fisherman's retail license. They are required to post it on their boat while making sales. They must fill out a tally sheet of every fish sold and attach it to the landing for the day. He reported there have been no major issues from fishermen selling off the boats.

Website: <https://www.wildlife.ca.gov/Fishing>

Morgan Gallardo (State regulator, CA Food & Agriculture)

Morgan is from the Division of Measurement Standards. He stated that the sole purpose of a weighmaster license is if either the buyer or seller is not present during the transaction. The weighmaster enforcement program assures that commercial transactions based on quantities certified on a weighmaster certificate are accurate. The weighmaster certificate authenticates the weight of the sale and is the legal document used for a transaction between buyer and seller. If a fisherman sells his catch to consumer at an agreed-upon weight on the scale, a weighmaster license is not needed, as both parties (buyer and seller) are present.

Website: <https://www.cdfa.ca.gov/dms/>

Carmen Kern (City & County Regulator, SF Department of Public Health)

San Francisco Department of Public Health represents the local part of the California Department of Food & Agriculture. Carmen advised the Weights and Measure program protects the consumer not only on the accuracy of the scales, but on how the product is sold to the customer. Inspections are conducted regularly to ensure sellers are selling only the fish and what is eaten (i.e. no ice on the scale). The scales used must be registered and certified with DPH.

Website: <https://www.sfdph.org/dph/EH/WeightsMeasures>

**Minutes from Public Meeting
Held June 2, 2017, at Port of San Francisco Offices, Pier 1
Regarding Retail Fish Sales off Boats at Fisherman's Wharf**

Alex Dmitriew (City & County Regulator, SF Department of Environment)

Alex spoke of a few San Francisco city ordinances. The plastic bag ordinance only applies to check stands; therefore, if selling fish off a boat, the ordinance does not apply in this situation. Styrofoam is banned in the city. Processors are prohibited by city ordinance from using Styrofoam to repackage fish. The fishing industry must also comply with the mandatory composting and recycling ordinance. He said through pier inspections, it's been a challenge to get the fishing industry to separate their trash, compostable, and recyclables. SF Environment offers assistance if needed.

Website: <https://sfenvironment.org>

Angela Cincotta (Fish Processor, Alioto-Lazio Fish Company)

Angela's family has been in the fishing industry since the 1890s. She believes the seafood industry in San Francisco's Fisherman's Wharf is a partnership. She said pitting fishermen against processors is harmful to the industry and that unless everyone works together, Fisherman's Wharf will become just a memory.

Next Steps

Port staff will use the information from the prior program in 1999 and the input from today's meeting to draft a staff report. The draft report [*actually these minutes*] will be shared with interested parties in mid-June. Comments and feedback are welcome. The forward plan is for Maritime to prepare a staff report and make an informational presentation at the Port Commission meeting on July 11, 2017. Members of the public will have the opportunity to express their views to the Commissioners at the meeting. The earliest the Port would seek approval of a new Retail Fish Sales Policy would be at the Port Commission meeting on August 8, 2017.